1-27-05

# NOTES ON THE HISTORY OF WORSHIP, by J. Robert Wright

## 1. Early Patristic Period

Should the early patristic period be our ideal for liturgy today and if so why?

### The celebration of all God's people

Eucharist is concelebrated, mainly on Sundays, by the entire priestly people of God, each according to their own function, the bishop or bishop/presbyter presiding (proïstamenos; cf. I Tim. 5:17), acting as head of the praying community but not instead of it. As such, the Eucharist is perceived to be itself the Christian assembly (ekklesia), a sacred communal meal that is both image and source of the unity of each local Christian community within itself and with the whole Church, thus actualizing and manifesting the new people of God as the Body of Christ and the sacrament of the Kingdom in time (cf. I Pet. 2:9, etc.). Eucharist, in relation to the church as the people whom God has called out (ek-klesia), is both the remembrance of their calling and also the realization of it. Thus, the Eucharist has "inner," rather than "outer," solemnity which is known to those who already understand the meaning. Realized eschatology: every day is a festival (the day of the Lord, of the Kingdom); all time and life are renewed in the Paschal Mystery, all the people of God are "holy" (sancti). Eucharist can be celebrated anywhere (cf. Clement of Alexandria, Stromateis VII, ch. 5), usually in private houses (Acts 2:46, 20:7; Rom. 16:5; I Cor. 16:19). Eucharistic "canon," not restricted to any one precise verbal form (Justin Martyr, I Apol. 65-7; Hippolytus, A.T., 10), is a solemn recalling before God of the whole work of redemption. Eucharistic bread is probably unleavened (paschal meal), but possibly leavened (word artos is ambiguous); from the 3rd century it is often braided and twisted into a 4-inch circle called a "corona." The "altar" is usually a moveable wooden table brought in only for the actual celebration. Bishop presides standing and preaches from his chair (replacing the "seat of Moses" in synagogues), sitting to preach/teach as was the custom of teachers in the ancient world. (Standing to preach from a pulpit is first made popular by John Chrysostom in later 4th century.) The very earliest Eucharists were probably celebrated in the evenings, all reclining around the same side of a table (shaped square, round, or horse-shoe [sigma]), in connection with the agape-dinner. Earliest evidence of a Eucharist celebrated by presbyters without a bishop comes from mid-3rd century in Cyprian letter 5, to the priests and deacons of Carthage, and virtually the only evidence of the Eucharist celebrated by baptized Christians without priest or bishop in the early church comes from Ethiopia at the beginning of the 4th century (Theodoret, H.E. I, 23,5).

### Relation to Jewish Liturgy

Basic daily, weekly, and yearly structures of early Christian prayer are inherited from Jewish synagogue worship: Daily public prayer

at sunrise and sunset, as well as private prayers (possibly) at the third, sixth, and ninth hours (the latter is affirmed by Klauser but denied by Jay), together with Scripture reading, hymns from Psalter, and instruction, is taken over from synagogue practice. Weekly Sunday celebration of the Eucharist is defined in relation to the sabbath day of rest, and the first part of the Eucharist (service of the word) comes from sabbath morning service at the synagogue. Yearly Jewish Passover and Pentecost festivals are transformed into Paschal and Whitsun celebrations. Other elements in early Christian liturgy of Jewish origin include: Basic themes of the Lord's prayer, Prayers of the Faithful (from the Prayer of Eighteen Intercessions at beginning of synagogue service), reckoning of the liturgical day from evening to evening, custom of introducing liturgical prayers by invitatory formulae (e.g., "Let us give thanks,"...etc.), congregational responses or acclamations, use of salvation-history in prayer paradigms. Content, structure, and key terms of Great Prayer of Thanksgiving ("canon") probably come from Jewish synagogue prayer known as Berakah ("blessing," which is translated eucharistia in Greek). Not Jewish but unique to the Last Supper and the Christian Eucharist are the Lord's words of institution interpreting the bread and wine as his Body and Blood (in every Eucharistic canon except possibly Addai and Mari, which may also have included them according to Bouyer and Tavard), and his command to do this in remembrance of him.

Position for Prayer

Position for "private" and "penitential" prayer was probably kneeling, in eastward direction (cf. Daniel 6:10, Luke 22:41, Acts 20:36, 21:5, Matthew 26:39). Orans position for public prayer: standing and facing geographical east, with hands spread outwards and upwards, especially on all Sundays and throughout the period from Easter to Pentecost, is indicated by Nicaea canon 20 and by a great many other writers (cf. I Samuel 1:26, Ps. 141:2, Mark 11:25, I Tim. 2:8). Orans and eastward position had both Jewish and Hellenistic precedents. For public Eucharistic prayer in orans position, both the president and the congregation stood facing geographical East, no matter what the position of the church building. For the Great Prayer ("canon") the president might stand on either side of the altar, which might be situated in either end or in the middle of the church building. In the earliest arrangements where the president did face people across the altar, however, both president and people faced the same eastward direction rather than each other (Bouyer, Jungmann, Klauser, Pocknee). First evidence for celebration in "versus populum" or "westward" direction, president and people facing each other, seems to be at Rome in late 6th century (Pope Gregory the Great, who moved the altar over the tomb at St. Peter's in Rome and presided facing the community of monks and clerics there). Generally the body posture and arm movements of the people followed the (few) motions of the bishop/presbyter who was presiding (Jungmann). Reasons given by patristic writers for orans/eastward position include: Rising Sun, Resurrection, Ascension, Second Coming. Early Christian churches and even cemeteries (both increasingly frequent in 4th century and later) are likewise generally

orientated, churches no longer facing earthly Jerusalem as did Jewish synagogues, but now towards geographical east, the direction of "Heavenly" Jerusalem whose Sun rises in the east and from which direction the Lord will come again (Matt. 24:27, Rev. 7:2). Orans position of Eucharistic celebrant will be retained throughout the Middle Ages for those prayers of patristic origin: collects, preface, canon, and Lord's Prayer.

Miscellaneous

Development of offertory procession in second and third centuries, coinciding with church's fight against Gnostic denial of material creation; entire congregation participated, offering bread and wine, money, and other gifts; Eucharist now comes to be described as oblatio or sacrificium (Irenaeus, A.H. IV.17.5, Tertullian, Hippolytus, Didache 14.1, Cyprian Letter 63.1, Ambrose, Nicaea canons 5,11,18, Egeria, Augustine DCD 10:6, Jungmann, Early Liturgy 117-18). After 5th century, oblatio tends to be replaced by missa. Kiss of peace, which in Justin and Hippolytus comes at the prayers of the faithful after dismissal of the catechumens, will shift in the 4th century to a position before communion.

Eucharistic Reservation

As early as Justin Martyr (I Apol. 65), Hippolytus (26, 32), Eusebius (VI.44), and Nicaea (canon 13), there is evidence of occasional reservation of the Eucharist, primarily for the sick and dying, also occasionally for those absent for other reasons, also for daily communion (Hippolytus, Tertullian, Ad uxorem, 2.5), and as the fermentum symbolizing Eucharistic unity of a bishop with his people or with another bishop.

2. Fourth Century: Constantine

How much of this is "Constantinian triumphalism" and how much inevitable development?

Constantinian Transformation

The Emperor Constantine's recognition or substitution of the Christian Church as the official religion of the Roman Empire is accomplished over a period of about ten years, from c. 313-324 AD: "triumphalism," although the changes may be more properly described as "evolutionary" (Shepherd) than "revolutionary" (Jungmann). So-called Edict of Milan, February 313, was primarily a granting of freedom to worship the Christian God, and "conversion" of the pagan multitudes was primarily a transfer of the object of their worship. There is now a gradual "sacralization" of Christian worship, probably unintended, as it becomes partly assimilated to the Hellenistic piety of the converts and partly reflective of the imperial court ceremonial. Transition in understanding of the Eucharist from a more eschatological and

ecclesiological cult which actualizes the new people of God as the Body of Christ and the sacrament of the Kingdom in time, to a more historicized and mysteriological cult which as an end in itself can be appropriated individualistically for the personal sanctification of its members. This transition parallels decreased expectation of an imminent Second Coming. In art, the futuristic eschatology of pre-Constantinian symbolism becomes realized, historicized, and narrated, as Sunday, made a public holiday by Constantine in 321, becomes a kind of Christian replacement for the Jewish "sabbath day of rest," and loses some of its earlier meaning as prima sabbati--the first day of the week when Christ rose and new life began and the Eucharist was celebrated and the Church was actualized.

Imperial Assimilation

Church with Constantine begins to take on various civil duties and privileges. State grants financial support to Christian clergy and exempts them from secular liturgies (Eusebius, E.H. x). Christian bishops become secular magistrates: in 318 Constantine grants them power of jurisdiction in civil proceedings involving Christians, with no appeal. In 321 bequests to the Church are made legal, and manumission of slaves done in church before a bishop are given full authority of the law. Although "We have no evidence for any ceremonial innovation in the liturgy during the reign of Constantine himself" (Shepherd, 61-2), the Eucharist over the 4th century begins to take on more outer solemnity with introduction of much stylized imperial court ceremonial: formal chant and hymnody, throne (at times of specified design and dimensions), lights, incense (formerly refused by Christians during the time of persecutions because it had been required as an act of idolatry to other gods), maniple (ceremonial napkin), camelaucum (headgear), campagi (footwear), ring, pallium or orarion (later known as stole; all three probably have same origin), kiss of hands, genuflections (proskynesis) to bishop, altar, relics, and icons, Bishop of Rome is granted the right to have his portrait hung in churches, to be greeted on his arrival at church by choir of singers (origin of the introit), to be waited upon at throne and altar with covered hands, and to have people genuflect to him and kiss his foot. Gradual transitions from house-church to basilica, from Domus ecclesiae to Domus Dei, from places of worship named for the owning family (e.g., S. Clemente, Rome) to places named for the patron saint, from emphasis upon the temple of God actualized as the Body of Christ in the Eucharistic assembly meeting anywhere (cf. Acts 7:48) to emphasis upon the independent significance of the church building itself as the most proper place for prayer -- now erected in the center of the city and thus assimilated to older pagan notions of the temple as the mystical core of the urbs (mysteriological sacralization). By mid-5th century it will become customary for the Byzantine emperor to be crowned in public by the Patriarch of Constantinople, accompanied by profession of the Orthodox faith. In both East and West worship becomes more mysterious and numinous, the church building itself a reflection of heaven, the liturgy a time taken from the troubles and cares of this present world to be spent apart with God together with the saints and angels in eternity. Horizontal structure of the basilica lends a more

hierarchical character to western worship, whereas the centralized dome-structure in the East preserves a more corporate sense.

The Eucharist Itself

Canon of Eucharist now in rather fixed form, probably sung (in monotone, with occasional inflections). Introduction of some fixed collects and lessons into the Eucharist, and of the Lord's Prayer as an immediate preparation for communion (Cyril of Jerusalem, John Chrysostom, Augustine). Lord's Prayer in Eucharist is said aloud by all, but elsewhere quietly because it (like the Creed) was part of the "discipline of the secret" (disciplina arcani). Formulas of prayer, under Hellenistic influence, develop in conformity to the laws of ancient rhetoric, especially in symmetry and the rhythm of sentence-endings. Three theologies of Eucharistic consecration are present at this time: 1) By epiclesis in Cyril of Jerusalem (Myst. Cat. V.7: "We call upon the merciful God to send the Holy Spirit on our offerings, so that He may make the bread Christ's Body and the wine Christ's Blood, for clearly whatever the Holy Spirit touches is sanctified and transformed"), and Theodore of Mopsuestia [Earliest clear assertion of consecration only by epiclesis and not by words of institution, however, does not come until St. John of Damascus in the 8th century, after which this understanding will be standard in the East]. 2) By words of institution in Tertullian, Ambrose (De Sac. 4:14, c. 391: "At the consecration this bread becomes the Body of Christ....By what words is the consecration effected and whose words are they? The words of the Lord Jesus....It is Christ's word that brings this sacrament into being." 3) By entire Prayer of Thanksgiving in Hippolytus (who has a non-consecratory epiclesis, which may be a later addition). The earthly Eucharist is seen by Eusebius, Cyril of Jerusalem, and others as an image or copy of heavenly reality. Prayer addressed to Christ, rather than to the Father, becomes more common in the later 4th century under influence of struggles against Arians, who tended to deny that the Son was "equal" to the Father. (Formal public prayers addressed to Christ do not enter the Roman liturgy, however, until the 11th century). Imperial recognition and anti-Arian struggles result in literary (4th century) and artistic (6th century) representations of Christ as Pantocrator, portrayed in the outward marks of imperial rank: ruler and judge on throne, jewels, purple cushions, royal halo, surrounded by heavenly court. Thus the divine grandeur and sovereignty of Christ not only come to overshadow his human nature, bur also to introduce a sense of awe and trembling into human worship. Mary now becomes the empress, apostles the senate, angels the court household, saints are guests seeking audience and bringing their offerings (cf. imperial court theology of Eusebius of Caesarea). Heightened Christology and Mariology following the Theotokos decision of the Third Ecumenical Council (Ephesus, 431) are expressed iconographically by Pope Sixtus III (432-40) in construction of the Roman basilica of S. Maria Maggiore on the Esquiline Hill to supplant the pagan cult of the mother goddess Juno Lucina there and to display Jesus as of one nature both human and divine and therefore Mary as Mother of God, reflected especially in the mosaics there of the Annunciation, Adoration of the Magi, and Arrival of the

Holy Family into Egypt. Transition in liturgical language at Rome from Greek to Latin occurs especially during 4th century (seen e.g. in Ambrose of Milan). Greek had begun to disappear from civic use at Rome in mid-3rd century. Roman canon is in Latin by late 4th century. Eucharistic reservation, still primarily for the sick and dying, is now maintained in the equivalent of "sacristies" (although occasionally in the church itself; cf. John Chrysostom, Finn 202), and kept inside little boxes or "towers."

Nicene Creed

Process for derivation of doctrine from the language of prayer gets its classical expression in early 5th century from St. Prosper of Aquitaine (Defense of St. Augustine, art. 8, c. 435-442): Legem credendi lex statuat supplicandi ("The law of praying establishes the law of believing"), later ascribed to Pope Celestine I and still later abbreviated as lex orandi lex credendi. First liturgical recitation of the Nicene Creed is at Antioch in 473 by order of Patriarch Peter the Fuller, a Monophysite who intended thereby to slight the creed of the Council of Chalcedon which had condemned Monophysitism. Nicene Creed is introduced into the Eucharist at Constantinople in early 6th century by Patriarch Timothy (511-517), then enters the Mass in the West (with filioque) at the Third Council of Toledo in 589 when King Reccared and his Arian Visigoths of Spain (seeking political unity) accept Catholicism, but it was not used in the Mass at Rome until 1014.

Cross and Altar

Christian cult of the cross develops with Constantine's labarum (312), Helena's discovery of the true cross (?326), and genuflection to relics of the true cross. Earliest surviving crucifixes date from 400 and 423. In Christian symbolism, the "cross cryptogram" (such as an anchor) in the 4th century becomes the "cross monogram" (such as the chi rho), now really a Christian trophy of victory. By the late 4th century the Christian altar (generally called by the word altare in Christian Latin, the word ara being reserved for pagan altars) is usually stone (no longer wooden table or sigma-shaped, but now cube-shaped about four feet square, often with relics enclosed, free-standing under a veiled ciborium (high covering) supported by columns, entirely covered with fine cloth during the celebration, nothing else upon it except vessels and gospelbook. Earliest references to kiss of altar are late 4th century and are salutations of it at beginning of Eucharist, as the sacred table; only later will kiss of altar be explained as veneration of the relics within it. Still at this time only one altar in each church until about 6th century. Increase now of week-day celebrations, especially at funerals and weddings. Daily celebrations at major churches in large cities by 5th century. Literary and archaeological evidence from England indicates that throughout the Anglo-Saxon period the principal altar was usually free-standing and not placed against the east wall. As late as the Norman Conquest in 1066, the chronicler Eadmer (precentor of Canterbury and friend of Anselm; RS 73, I.9) reports that Archbishop Lanfranc --before the changes that followed the

great fire there in 1067--presided from an altar dedicated to St. Mary in a raised chapel in the apse at the west end of the nave, his throne being situated behind this altar facing east, and celebrated eastward over the heads of the congregation, who also turned their faces towards the east and thus their backs on the archbishop, all facing the high altar of Christ the Savior which was in the eastern apse (Taylor; Pocknee, 94; Brooke, 20, 172-5; Deanesly, Pre-Conquest Church, 138-9; Southern, Anselm, 251, 262-7). This practice was changed at Canterbury in Lanfranc's time, after which he then began to celebrate from the east end behind an altar there and facing the people (Brooke, 39-40), as we know did his contemporary Bishop Herbert Losinga of Norwich.

Calendar and Hagiography

Developing "historical" interest in sacred topography at this time is first evidenced by Constantine and Helena toward Jerusalem and the Holy Land as the center of Jesus' earthly life. Importance of Jerusalem as an episcopal see is indicated by canon 7 of Nicaea, and liturgical influence of Jerusalem is seen in the Pilgrimage of Egeria. Evolution of the liturgical commemoration of Holy Week, from the topography of Jerusalem under St. Cyril there c. 383-6, enables participants to re-live mysteriologically the original events of the passion. Expansion of "calendar" by the historicization of festivals originally eschatological in character. The Sunday and Paschal-Whitsun commemorations are expanded in the 4th century to include Christmas, Epiphany, Ascension, Lent, Ember Days, some octaves, and some feasts of martyrs; in some cases these replace pagan festivals, in other cases they affirm developments in theology, and in still others they simply reflect the growing interest in "history" and the growing influence of the sacred topography of Jerusalem and Constantinople. A "mysteriological" concept of feast days comes to be fostered as the cultic re-enactment or re-presentation of earlier events whereby power and salvation are conveyed to the individual recipients. Specific saints begin to be cultivated for their sanctifying and intercessory powers; contact is made by means of relics and icons. The earliest distinctions of prayers addressed to specific saints, as contrasted with prayers for all the faithful departed who are alive in Christ, is probably made by St. Augustine in his sermon 285. Hagiography begins to shift from thanksgivings for the presence and action of Christ in individual martyrs, to glorification of the individual saints themselves for their power and miracles and kindness to those who intercede for them. Restriction of the meaning of the term sanctus now; no longer are all Christians called to be holy, as was the case in the NT and in Hippolytus.

Monasticism

After cessation of persecutions and martyrdoms in the 4th century, the earliest tendencies of rigorism and realized eschatology in the church come to be channeled into the development of monasticism as a means of renouncing "the world" and more intensely following Christ.

Celibacy

In addition to monastic developments, and viewing celibacy also as a more intense way of following Christ, the earlier patristic notion grows that although holy orders are not to be withheld from clergy already married before ordination to the diaconate, single clergy cannot marry after ordination to the diaconate. In the 4th century now, the conjugal rights of married clergy in the West come to be restricted to "spiritual" (non-carnal) co-habitation, and Pope Leo the Great in 466 lowers this division-line from diaconate to sub-diaconate.

Theological Interpretation and Clerical Separation

Growing demand for sexual continence before receiving communion as well as increasing emphasis (vs. Arians) upon remote divinity of Christ, cause decreasing frequency of communion of the laity. A heightened sense of the sacred, of mystery, of awe and trembling, comes to be attached to the Eucharistic rite itself, the act of communion, and the sacred elements themselves (Cyril of Jerusalem, Theodore of Mopsuestia, Liturgies of SS. James, Basil the Great, John Chrysostom), and all this is reflected in postures for reception of communion (seen, for example on the patens of Riha and Stuma, Rossano codex), rather than being attached to the unworthy reception of the elements as in St. Paul (I Cor. 11:27-30). Understanding of the Eucharistic sacrifice tends to shift from notion of praise and thanksgiving to that of efficacious intercession (Cyril, Theodore), as clergy come to be regarded as more mediatorial in their cultic function. Earliest written evidence for screens dividing clergy from laity comes at Tyre in the 4th century (Eusebius, E.H. X), although the full iconostasis does not come until the 15th and 16th centuries in Russia (and never in the non-Chalcedonian churches). Special "vestments" begin to be worn by the clergy/celebrants of the Eucharist at Jerusalem and Antioch in the 4th century, and increasingly so in the East in the 5th century. In the West clergy generally wear ordinary clothes until the early 7th century, although some special clerical dress (cassock, at least) begins to appear as early as the 5th century. When barbarian invaders swarm down from northern Europe and introduce men's trousers to Rome in the 5th century, clergy continue to wear the everyday garb of imperial Rome as cassock, chasuble, alb, and cope. Pope Celestine I forbids special clerical dress in 428, saying that a bishop should be distinguishable from his flock "by his teaching, not his dress." Process of "clericalization of the church" and then "clergyfication of the clerics" (J. LeClercq), as the clerical state of life becomes not only a sacramental entity but also a distinct rank (ordo) of sociological reality.

Penance

From 4th to 6th centuries, development of public liturgy of penance, generally done only once in a Christian's lifetime, for major sins only (apostasy, adultery, murder; minor sins were confessed by one lay Christian to another). Three steps in public penance: 1) private

confession to bishop or presbyter and public enrollment in the order of penitents at beginning of Lent; 2) penance itself, often based on asceticism of food, money, or sex;, and exclusion from the Eucharist; and 3) public reconciliation (absolution) with laying-on-of-hands, at the Easter vigil or (later) on Maundy Thursday. In time this sort of penitential asceticism will become institutionalized in monasticism.

## 3. Eighth Century: Charlemagne

Which of these developments are theologically objectionable to you, even in their historical context, and why?

### Centuries of transition

Secular privileges granted to the Church under Constantine become spiritualized or sacralized following the fall of the Roman Empire in 5th century. "Gregorian chant" develops under (but not by) Pope Gregory the Great (590-604), who also reduces the Mass "Prayers of the Faithful" to only the Kyrie and moves the Lord's Prayer (which has been in the Eucharist since the 4th century) to a position immediately at the end of the canon and before the Breaking of Bread rather than after it, as had earlier been the case. Origins of classical Roman sacramentaries (based upon the principle of differentiation by function or person): Leonine (Veronese), 6th and early 7th century; Gelasian (MS. Vat. Reg. Lat. 316), c. 740; Gregorian, mid-8th century and later. Ordo Romanus Primus (first of the ancient Roman ceremonial directories) gives account of papal Mass at Rome in early 8th century. In 747, Synod of Cloveshoe (influence of St. Boniface) requires general use in England of the Roman Rite for Baptism and Mass (canon 13) and of the seven canonical prayer hours with psalmody and chant according to Roman usage (Ellard, 9-10; Albertson, 14).

### Charlemagne and the Liturgical Influence of Rome

Last Exarch of Ravenna is driven out by the Lombards in 751. Pepin and later Charlemagne are crowned as protectors of the Roman Church; "Christianitas" has come to equal "Romanitas." Aachen, Charlemagne's capital, is seen as "New Rome." Imperial laudes (formal liturgical salutation of the secular ruler) following the collect are introduced into the Mass in Frankish lands on occasion in the later 8th century. Frankish transition to Roman liturgy, prescribed by King Pepin the Short at his coronation in presence of Pope Stephen II (III) at St. Denis in 754, is continued by the liturgical "borrowings" of Charlemagne from Pope Hadrian I. In 785-6 Hadrian sends Charlemagne, at his request, a form of the Gregorian Sacramentary now known as the "Hadrianum," which is then revised (with a Supplement beginning "Hucusque") either by Alcuin, religious advisor to Charlemagne, or more probably by Benedict of Aniane, a contemporary monastic reformer; it never, however, entirely replaces the earlier Gelasian. Pope Leo III renders proskynesis to Charlemagne at his coronation on Christmas Day 800, the first and last time such veneration is rendered to an emperor by a pope! Roman liturgy

is now clearly a central part of the plan for Carolingian imperial unity; the nation that prays together stays together; one emperor, one faith; compare policy of Constantine! Even clerical dress is now to be "according to the Roman custom." Yearly examination in liturgical matters is prescribed for clergy by royal decree in the Carolingian period. Nicene Creed is introduced into the Gallican Mass under Charlemagne following earlier Spanish example. Regnal years of the Eastern Roman emperor disappear from papal documents under Pope Hadrian I in 781-2 and are replaced by pontifical years; regnal years of Charlemagne are added to pontifical years in papal documents under Pope Leo III in 798. Hence, "translation of empire" as the papacy is emancipated from constitutional framework of the Eastern Roman Empire.

The Mass in Feudal Europe

First part of the Mass comes to lose its character as a service of instruction and the sermon tends to become separated from the Eucharist itself. Psalm 42 appears at the beginning of Mass as a sort of preparation. As early as the 7th century, lectio continua for the OT and NT readings (whereby patristic liturgical homilies had really been commentaries upon the books of the Bible as they were read serially in the Eucharist, chapter by chapter in many cases) has been superseded by specific pericopes. Episcopal presidency of the Eucharist is no longer possible for the norm as the church spreads north into the villages and countryside. Increase of "private" Masses during the 6th and 7th centuries in monasteries as result of desire to honor saints whose relics are now enclosed in the several altars of each church in imitation of the many stational churches of the city of Rome (Häussling). The "local church" gathered in an abbey is thus thought to parallel the local church of the diocese of Rome. In this way Mass now becomes a form of individual private devotion. Multiplication of private Masses as individual means of grace is stimulated at this time in southern Gaul by Pelagian controversies. Eucharistic worship now becomes more private than public, and votive Masses for individual needs multiply. Collection of votive Masses is compiled by Alcuin, with particular ones assigned to each day of the week. Proliferation of priests is now necessary for celebration of so many Masses, and hence there is an increase in ordinations to priesthood, especially in monastic houses. Gulf develops between the celebrant and the people who have requested and endowed such Masses. Altars proliferate. Celebration of Mass comes to be seen as the only, or at least the major, role of the presbyteral order. Daily celebration by each priest (usually at the third hour, 9 a.m.) becomes customary by the 9th century. "Low" Mass is now often celebrated by one priest alone, with lector but without D or SD. Silent canon prevails in the East since about the 6th century; in West first about 800 in Gallican territory under Eastern influences, then in Rome c. 1000; canon is silent because the Sanctus is still being sung, but also to increase the sense of mystery. OT assimilation occurs, by which the priest alone enters the "sanctuary of the canon" ("Like the High-priest of the Old Testament, who once a year was permitted to enter the Holy of Holies with the blood of a sacrificial animal [Heb. 9:7], the priest now separates from the

people and makes his way before the all-holy God in order to offer up the sacrifice to Him." Jungmann II, 139, n.3). Mass is now allegorically interpreted by theologians as ritual drama, for example by Amalarius of Metz (Liber Officialis), thus replacing the gap left by demise of classical theatre. (Way is thus open for rise of representational drama in 10th century with the dialogue ceremony Quem Queritis, originally associated with the Easter vigil). One popular explanation of the Mass, produced in response to Charlemagne's capitulary of 802 asking clergy to instruct the faithful, gave interpretations of only those parts that were audible to the people and hence omitted any explanation of the canon at all! The oratio super oblata, or secret, is said silently now in Frankish territory after the 8th century. Private celebrant's prayers (priestly "I" superseding the congregational "we") also begin to "cover" most public actions of the Eucharist, focusing the celebrant's attention but also obscuring its corporate nature. And the celebrant's prayers, in turn, are "covered" in sung Masses by choral and diaconal interventions. Troped Kyries, farced Glorias, and sequences after the Epistle, which enter sung Masses from the 9th to the 16th centuries, also tend to obscure the basic meanings. "High" Mass by the 9th century is embellished with Asperges at the beginning, and frequent incensations of persons and objects throughout. Also, by the Carolingian period, the celebrant's demonstrative gestures indicating the bread and wine as Sacred Gifts, seen as early as Hippolytus, have become signs of the cross, causative and not merely indicative, and the Priest's Blessing and Last Gospel have become standard conclusions to the Mass.

Position for Prayer

Prayers which enter the Mass in this period, e.g. at the offertory and communion, are said by celebrant with hands folded, the posture of submissiveness, of resignation to a higher power, characteristic of feudal northern Europe and traceable to a Teutonic origin. Custom by which a feudal vassal or liegeman vowed homage and fealty by kneeling and pressing his hands inside those of his lord now begins to have its impact upon theology and church life; in the 10th-century English Blickling Homilies, even the bishop is "God's vassal"! Posture for prayer has thus changed: now one kneels with hands clasped; note implications of this for doctrine of God. Kneeling is recommended at Synod of Tours, 813, as the natural position and normal posture for the faithful. Also, theological "distance" of priest from people, and intercessory nature of the Eucharistic canon, are now heightened by insertion of the words "for whom we offer unto thee," in front of the words "who offer unto thee this sacrifice of praise" in explanation of the words "Remember all those who here around us stand" in the canon of the Mass (first occurs in the 9th century Carolingian recension of the Gregorian sacramentary by Benedict of Aniane, or possibly Alcuin). Emphasis upon unworthiness of celebrant (who begins to bid Orate Fratres in the 8th century) and of congregation (kneeling, with hands folded), seeking hereby to appropriate spiritual grace and individual salvation. Sacrament is no longer received on hand but tongue (as specified by council of Rouen, 878), an indication of increasing sacralization and a

countermeasure to resurgence of Arianism), kneeling and no longer standing, and much less frequently. Later, communion rails will develop to assist this method of reception. Increasingly widespread abstention from communion on grounds of unworthiness and reverence eventually stimulates people to seek devotional compensation by adoration of the sacred elements upon their knees. Among Orthodox Byzantine Christians living under the Moslem caliphs in the East, however, it became a matter of pride that while they were compelled to grovel in the dust before the heathen caliph, in the church they were still able to stand on their feet as free agents before their God.

Elements, Vessels, and Altars

Loaves of bread baked at home begin to be replaced by small round white unleavened "hosts" during the period from the 7th to the 9th centuries, often baked now according to intricate liturgical formulae and now brought to the altar for Mass in particles already separated. Paten evolves in shape from larger platter-like dish to a tiny thin plate fitting over the cup of the chalice and matching it, and Charlemagne decrees that chalices must be made of gold or silver. At least three types of chalice are in use by this period: the calix sanctus, the calix ministerialis (for communicating people), and the calix offerendae or calix offertorialis (for receiving wine at the offertory); but the latter two tend to disappear as lay reception of the chalice becomes less frequent. Development of ciborium to hold wafers. Proliferation, translation, and veneration of relics of saints, now removed from their burial places and "raised to the altars" (up behind, leaving no room for celebrant to stand behind), now seen as intermediaries to God, intercessors, and workers of miracles; cf. ceremony for translation of relics in the 10th century English Lanalet pontifical. Reliquaries and portable altars thus also multiply. The demand for votive Masses, custom of daily celebration, and increasing veneration of saints, all produce changes in church architecture as need develops for many side altars. Earlier custom of only one Mass per day in any one church is now transferred to a rule of only one Mass per day at any one altar. Menorah (Jewish seven-branched candlestick) is now appropriated for Christian usage.

Carolingian influence upon Rome

Carolingian initiatives and Franco-German church leadership of the 8th-9th centuries now come to influence liturgical developments in Rome, as the Cluniac movement spreads into Italy and as the powerful Saxon rulers Otto I the Great, Otto II, and Henry II come to dominate Rome at a time when it is politically and liturgically very weak, imposing upon it now the Gregorian sacramentary of Pope Hadrian conflated with the Supplement of Benedict of Aniane. Nicene Creed is introduced into the Roman Mass in 1014 at the coronation, by Pope Benedict VIII, of King Henry II, who demands that the Romans now follow this Franco-German custom. The Creed is eventually singularized, as the priest comes to speak for, and instead of, all the people.

Vestments

Since the 9th century private prayers are used by the celebrant while vesting. All the Christian sacerdotal vestments (as well as many theological themes) are now being described in terms of their corresponding Levitical prefigurations under the Old Law (Isidore of Seville, Walafrid Strabo, etc). Amice, in origin a neck cloth, is after the 9th century worn over the head while vesting to keep the celebrant's long hair in place; apparel is added to it in the 10th century to give weight when throwing it back. There is frequent mention of liturgical combs in the 10th century and after, although the earliest specimens are Celtic of the 6th and 7th centuries. The maniple is still carried in the hand until the 11th or 12th centuries. Orarion comes to be called "stole" in the 9th century, but its color does not customarily match that of the chasuble until much later, around the council of Trent. Ecclesiastical legislation of the 9th and 10th centuries makes it obligatory for priests to wear a stole at all times, even when at home or in travel. Chasuble (casula, meaning "little house," originally a rain-poncho conical in shape and also called, from II Tim. 4:13, phailonion, planeta, or paenula) has by the Carolingian period become strictly an ecclesiastical vestment, but it is not yet limited to the use of only the celebrant of the Mass; its evolution is an example of the "Frank Lloyd Wright principle" working in liturgical history, as "Form follows function"! Also during the Carolingian period, the crozier becomes a standard part of insignia for bishops.

Reservation

Purpose of sacramental reservation is still primarily for communion of the sick and dying, but also from the 8th to the 11th centuries the Eucharist is occasionally reserved for other purposes: communion of a bishop 40 days after his consecration, communion of a virgin 8 days after her consecration, sealing inside an altar at its consecration, and as sancta to symbolize continuity of each Eucharist with its predecessor. Sacrament is also reserved from Holy Thursday to Good Friday for Liturgy of the Pre-sanctified after the 8th century, and from Thursday for the Easter Sepulchre after the 10th century. Place of reservation after the late 9th century is no longer the sacristy but inside the church itself, often near the altar in a suspended dove or in a pyx placed on the altar itself. Eucharistic dove first appears in the late 11th century (France), to emphasize real presence (vs. Berengar) and procession of Holy Spirit from Son as well as from Father (Nicene Creed with filioque, common in Mass after the 10th century).

Church Dedications

Rites for dedication of a church develop during the 8th century in imitation of those for Christian initiation, with holy water and chrism applied to altar and walls of the church by the bishop (Sacramentary of Angoulême, with OT assimilation from Ex. 29, 30: 1 & 25-28, 40:9-10 & 24ff; Lev. 8 & 16).

Private Penance

Development of private penance in the 7th century, largely from influence of Celtic monks in their missions to convert the half-civilized people of northern Europe, as the "normal" Christian life is gradually assimilated to monastic asceticism. Confession and penance are now more frequent (once a year by c. 800), now for minor sins as well as for major ones, administered exclusively now by the clergy, now with more of a didactic element (counsel about faith and morals). Penances are now graded in standard penitential books, and commutations and redemptions of penances become possible. In the period from the 8th to 11th centuries, penance itself will come to be regularly performed after absolution more as a punishment, rather than before absolution as an act of reconciliation.

Ordination

Older practice of popular local election of ordinands is by the 8th century replaced by something like an ecclesiastical career system, with apprenticeship, lines of advancement, etc, all given expression and designation in the ordination rites (cf. Isidore of Seville, 7th century, where the ultimate Christian "initiation" becomes Ordination rather than Baptism!). In monastic communities, there is a great increase during the 7th and 8th centuries in ordinations to the priesthood both for purpose of saying additional Masses at additional altars as well as for missionary work. Anointing of hands first appears in western ordination rites in the 8th century (Missale Francorum, with OT sanction from Ex. 28:41 and Numbers 3:3), followed between then and the 10th century by investiture with stole and chasuble (Sacramentary of Gellone, c. 750-780) and by tradition of chalice and paten (Romano-Germanic pontifical, 950). Promise of obedience (ordinand's hands folded within those of the bishop) also first appears in the Romano-Germanic pontifical of the 10th century, apparently based on custom of feudal vows and possibly intended as an early protest against lay investiture. From the Romano-Germanic pontifical these ceremonies all find their way back to Rome in the 11th century, are further elaborated by Durandus of Mende in the late 13th century and by the Roman curia later in the 15th century, and become part of the post-Tridentine Roman pontifical of 1596.

4. Twelfth Century: Gregorian Reforms and Scholasticism

What positive evaluation can be made of these developments?

Characteristics of the period

Feudalization of the Church, transition of paroikia (parish) from eschatological sojourn to landed community with territorial boundaries, Gregorian reform movement summarized in First Lateran (ninth ecumenical) Council of 1123, papal centralization, denigration of "sacerdotal" character of secular ruler and corresponding elevation of concept of

priesthood (Gregory VII: "Who among [kings and emperors] is able, by his own word, to create the Body and Blood of the Lord? From this it is apparent how greatly superior in power is the priestly dignity [to the royal or lay]."), legal establishment of priestly celibacy and abolition of even "non-carnal" cohabitation for clergy, emphasis upon ritual purity necessary for priest to offer the Eucharistic sacrifice, "final" split between East and West c. 1054, suppression of Spanish Mozarabic rite by Gregory VII (and attempted suppression of rite of Milan) in pressure for Roman liturgical uniformity, growth and codification of western (papal) canon law and definition of the church in terms of it. A new type of activist spirituality, direct ecclesiastical intervention in the secular realm under papal leadership, is seen in the Crusades. Western liturgical leadership now passes from Franco-German influence back to Rome and the papacy under Gregory VII, who demands that episcopal sees of western Europe follow exclusively the liturgical traditions of Rome. Rapid increase in canonization of saints between 1100-1200 under papally-centralized process (total of 50). Peter Lombard's Sentences codify in later 12th century the number of sacraments at seven, standardizing the longer and more varied lists of Augustine, Hugh of St. Victor, Third Lateran Council of 1179, and others, and distinguishing between the sacramentum (outward sign or appearance) and the res (inward reality or invisible grace); further codification in 1439 in the Decretum pro Armenis (Decree for the Armenians) of the Council of Florence, which distinguishes between matter, form, minister, and intention, all of which can be proper or improper.

Eucharistic controversies

New developments in Eucharistic controversies proceed thus:

a. Spiritualist interpretation: Augustinian line >> Ratramnus in 9th century >> Berengar in 11th century >> influence upon Eucharistic thought in 16th century England.

b. Literalist interpretation: Ambrosian line >> Radbertus in 9th century >> Lanfranc in 11th century >> IV Lateran formulation of transubstantiation (substance changes, accidents remain). → John MacQuarrie's [illegible]

By the 12th century, there is even greater emphasis upon the nature of the Eucharistic presence within the elements of bread and wine rather than upon the nature of the Eucharistic assembly as a whole, genuflection to Eucharistic elements, and increasing frequency of prayers addressed to Christ rather than to the Father (first such formal public prayer in the Roman Mass itself was "O Lord Jesus Christ who said to your apostles Peace I leave with you..." from the early 11th century). Also, the Roman "reform" synods of 1059, and later (vs Berengar of Tours) affirm that the Body and Blood of Christ in the Mass are "sensually, not only sacramentally but in reality, handled by the priest and broken and crushed by the teeth of the faithful" (a formula composed by Cardinal Humbert and accepted by Berengar under coercion). In opposing his former teacher Berengar on this point, Archbishop Lanfranc composed the first distinct description of the Eucharistic change written Aristotelian substance/accidents categories, and his "triumph" over Berengar represents the first major success in the

revival of Aristotelian thought in the Middle Ages (R.W. Southern). Concern over this "heresy" of Berengar was also ultimately responsible for the mid-12th century switch in understanding of the terms Eucharist and Church: Generally up to c.1150 Eucharist = "Corpus Christi mysticum" (the mystical Body of Christ), and Church = "Corpus Christi verum" (the true Body of Christ) [Augustine, for example (City of God XXI.25) spoke of receiving "the sacrament of the Body of Christ *in the true Body of Christ*"], but inversion of these meanings came after the mid-12th century to counter Berengar's seeming denial of literal identity of the Eucharist with the Body born of Mary. Hereafter, Eucharist comes to be called the "Corpus Christi verum" (the true Body), and the Church is the "Corpus Christi mysticum" (the mystical Body). An early example of this switch is the prayer before communion of Archbishop Anselm of Canterbury in the late 11th or early 12th century: "May I be worthy to be incorporated into your Body, which is the Church" (Ward, 101). Later inheritors of this switch include the BCP, "members incorporate in the mystical body of thy Son, which is the blessed company of all faithful people," and Hooker, "that mystical body which is the society of souls." The classical definition of transubstantiation developed at the IV Lateran Council (1215) against the Albigensian heretics stated that "the Body and Blood" are contained under the species of the bread and wine, the bread being transubstantiated into the Body and the wine into the Blood by divine power" ("transubstantiatis pane in corpus, et vino in sanguinem potestate divina"). Even this, however, was a metaphysical statement still preserving a good deal of the mystery, and it was further elaborated in realist categories by Thomas Aquinas in the 13th century as being a change of substance but not of accidents such as color, taste, or smell. There are, Thomas says, the sacrament alone, which is the bread and wine (sacramentum tantum, or matter), the sacramental or symbolic reality, which is the true body of Christ (res et sacramentum, Corpus Christi verum), and the reality alone, which is the sacrament's effect (res tantum, or grace conferred) (ST III,76,6). Although in his earlier writing Thomas did use the term "transubstantio," Thomas in his later writing preferred the term "conversio" and denied "any local presence of Christ's Body in this sacrament" (ST III,76,5). By c. 1300, the IV Lateran formula of transubstantiation came to be understood as intended to exclude all other interpretations, especially the Ratramnus-Berengar line of "spiritual" interpretation. Scotus and Ockham in the 14th century then affirm this IV Lateran position on transubstantiation as a defined article of faith while at the same time admitting that they believe the other position (Ratramnus-Berengar) on grounds of philosophical reason (influence of nominalism). Then by the 15th century (e.g., Council of Constance) transubstantiation will come to be understood as the annihilation of the accidents as well as of the former substance, the material bread and wine becoming after consecration mere appearances or illusions that "cover" the particular substantial reality of the Body and Blood which cannot (for nominalists) be a universal category. By such developments, it may now be observed, the basic sacramental and incarnational principles are finally denied, by which material realities, without ceasing to be material, were understood to convey ontologically the presence of the divine.

Penance

After the Berengarian controversy the Eucharist and Penance gradually come to be seen as somehow superior to Baptism because they are both repeatable whereas Baptism is not, and because the Eucharist conveys the true Body of Christ substantially and in reality. In this milieu the "Penitential-Eucharistic theory of the Atonement" evolves, representing a transition in understanding of the way in which persons appropriate salvation and participate in the life of God. Whereas patristic emphasis had focused on the once-for-all victory of Christ appropriated once-for-all in Baptism and re-affirmed in the Eucharist, the emphasis now shifts (beginning with Anselm) to the notion of a God who is placated more gradually: Penance and Eucharist (both repeatable) become the regular means by which one pays one's servicium debitum or due service owed to God's "honor" as feudal lord, by which one makes "satisfaction" to God who demands justicia. In Anselm's satisfaction theology, the Atonement is now seen as a transaction between the Son and the Father, and the Eucharist and Penance as the principal means of appropriating the benefits of this transaction. The "satisfaction" aspect of sacramental Penance is likewise heightened at this time by a shift in the customary sequence, common by the 11th century, from confession>satisfaction>reconciliation, to the sequence of confession> reconciliation>satisfaction. This tended to lessen the apparent finality of absolution and to increase the significance of the satisfaction to be performed.

Related also to these concepts of gradual appropriation of the Atonement and gradual satisfaction for sin, is the transition in art and poetry at this time from the prominence of Christus Rex (Christ the King) to Der Herr des Leidens (the man of suffering): the notion of gradual incorporation into the man of sorrows, no longer to reign with him in glory (Christus Rex, distant and rather stern), but now to share with him (the crucified one on the cross, close and loving) in his sufferings and compassion. Thus the prayers of St. Anselm, later 11th century, emphasize meditation upon the passion. For the first 1000 years of church history, the image of Christ the King was dominant and the figure of the dead Christ was almost never depicted; earliest surviving Western example of the latter is the wooden crucifix made for Archbishop Gero of Cologne (969-76) in Cologne Cathedral. (Transition to dead Christ on the cross began earlier in the East, however, in the late 9th century, after the iconoclastic controversy. Even in the mid-11th century Cardinal Humbert accused the Greeks of making "the image of a dying man serve as the crucified Lord"). Pre-occupation with Christ's passion also now tends to shift the Eucharistic focus backwards into past history, rather than, as in the patristic period, forward into the eschatological timelessness of God.

Alterations in architecture and Mass structure

From about 900-1100 it becomes the general practice for altars (no longer veiled) to be located against the east wall of the church (in some cases as early as the 6th century), often at a height elevated by steps, with retables, candles, and relics upon them. Removal of altar

to rear wall in cathedrals necessitates moving the bishop's throne and stalls of his assistants to either side of the apse. Increase of ceremonies, especially moving of the book from epistle to gospel side, results in enlargement of high altar from earlier size of about a four-foot cube to be as long as 12 feet in the later middle ages, with corresponding development of reredoses. Evolution and proliferation of "low" Masses (even without lector), of side altars, of votive Masses and Mass stipends. "Reform" synods of 10th and 11th centuries limit to three the number of Masses a priest may say in one day. Enticing enumerations of the "benefits" of Mass (later specifically attacked by Cranmer) begin to appear in the 13th century: while hearing Mass, one does not grow any older; souls in purgatory for whom Mass is being heard will not suffer; on the same day after hearing Mass: one's food tastes better, one will not be hungry, one will not go blind, one will not die a sudden death. As communal celebration of the Eucharist disappears, priest himself reads the epistle and gospel from either side of the altar, the book turned slightly outward to signify "towards the people." Beginning in the 12th century it becomes customary in "high" Mass for the celebrant and his assistant(s) to read all the texts even when they are being sung by other groups. In the 11th century the people begin to kneel for the canon, which still refers to them as "standing" (circumstantes). Offertory procession (which, as a formal procession of the entire congregation with three-fold division of the offertory gifts for use at that celebration, for support of the clergy, and for charity to the poor, had been common since the days of Tertullian and was frequently enjoined by synods up to the 11th century) disappears altogether by the year 1200 (except in Requiem Masses), partly under influence of shift from agrarian to more commercial (monied) economy in the later 11th century. Lavabo, now superfluous because the offertory procession has gone, is retained, probably because of symbolic significance. Decrease in frequency of communion, as both yearly confession and communion at least every Easter are urged by IV Lateran council of 1215, although daily reception is recommended for the devout by Peter Damian, Gregory VII, Peter Lombard, and Thomas Aquinas (analogy with "daily bread" of the Lord's Prayer). Hands of lay people (because they are not anointed) may no longer even touch the Sacrament, although popes of Avignon occasionally permit certain lay princes to touch the chalice on certain feast days. Trend towards communion in one kind, often after Mass rather than within it. (Lay Folks' Mass Book, 13th century, English, contains no directions for communion by the laity)! Concept of "spiritual communion" develops. Reception of the chalice by the laity is first officially forbidden at the Council of Constance (1415), and those priests who offer it to the laity are to be excommunicated. There is a trend (especially from later 14th and 15th centuries) towards multiplication of "private" Masses for particular intentions, as nominalism in theology and philosophy comes to destroy belief in unity of all Eucharists in one heavenly reality and insists upon Masses with particular benefits for particular persons and even particular sins, as in Votive and Requiem Masses (e.g. following after the Black Death), with payments of stipends.

Symbolism, Drama, and Changes in Eucharistic Devotion

Rise of imitative symbolism within the Mass, as the spoken word fails to project its own contents. Whereas earlier the celebrant kissed the altar only upon approaching it, and later also upon leaving it, now since the late 13th century comes to be the custom every time the celebrant turns his face toward the people. Each kiss and turn is now explained by theologians as symbolizing a post-resurrection appearance of the Lord! Other imitative symbolism includes a kiss of the celebrant's hands when he is handed any object at High Mass, sign of cross at the Benedictus as early as the 11th century, multiplication of signs of the cross in the canon, genuflection before and after every touching of the Blessed Sacrament (15th century), bowing the head at the Memento of the dead and striking the breast at "Nobis quoque" in the canon. Parallel high medieval dramatic instincts produce the mystery plays of this period, as well as the Gothic Mass commentaries by Pseudo-Hildebert, Jean Beleth, Honorius of Autun, Sicard of Cremona, Rupert of Deutz, Innocent III, and William Durandus. Scholastic discussions of substance and accidents lead to Fourth Lateran Council's assertion of transubstantiation in 1215 against the Eucharistic "errors" of the Albigensian heretics. Central elevation of the Host during the words of institution has already begun to replace the earlier tradition of elevating both elements at the end of the canon (Ordo Romanus Primus) by the mid-12th century, as theologians by then agreed that the bread and wine were changed into the Body and Blood at the Lord's words in the canon. A diocesan synod of Paris, probably c. 1208-15, refined the question of a precise "moment" still further, decreeing that it would be material idolatry to adore the Host before the Lord's words of institution were said (and therefore the Host should not be elevated before then), but that the Host should be elevated after the words "This is my Body" in order to signify that the transubstantiation of the bread was complete without the words over the wine, and vice versa. This teaching soon spread to other dioceses and religious orders. Honorius III in 1217 required a bell to be rung at this point as the "moment of change," and this is the view held by Aquinas (ST III,78,6). The earliest written evidence for the practice of genuflecting after this elevation of the Host, moreover, comes from the years 1200-06 in the writings of the great English theologian Stephen Langton (later archbishop of Canterbury). Central elevation of the chalice dates from the later 13th century in popular usage, but was not "standard" until Missal of Pius V in 1570. Custom of holding fingers together after elevation of the Holy begins in the late 11th century and is general practice by 13th century. Genuflections before and after the central elevations are not common until the late 15th century and become definitive in the Missal of Pius V (earlier practice was simple bow). By 13th century Thomas Aquinas and others will be teaching that, whereas Christ's sacrifice on the cross was sufficient to atone for original sin, the sacrifice of the Mass is necessary for actual sins. From a devotional longing to see what is concealed, stem the origins of Eucharistic miracles in which the Lord appears during Mass in his own human form, often as a child (Aquinas gives directions on what the priest is to do: ST III,76,82). Devotional weight of the second half of

the Eucharist has now shifted to the consecration, as the offertory, fraction, and communion have all but disappeared from sight. Devotion to the Lord's "True Body" in the Eucharist also is accompanied by an increasing devotion to his sacred humanity, primarily centering upon his cross and passion. This devotional emphasis is reflected in the custom of cross or crucifix now placed upon the altar, which is standard equipment by 13th century, and in rood screens from the 12th century onwards. Multiplicity of devotional aids clutter interior of the church building, but provide attractions for wandering eyes no longer able to understand, or really see, the Mass.

Ordination

Thomas Aquinas says of tradition of the instruments that "The conferring of a power is effected by giving to its subjects something which belongs to the proper exercise of that power." Thus, at ordination the priest is now understood to receive power over the True Body of Christ, and the bishop (higher grade of priest) to receive power over the Mystical Body of Christ (the church). Duns Scotus in the 14th century expands this by explaining that at ordination of a priest the second imposition of hands (introduced from about 1025, with the words of John 20:23) confers power to forgive sins. Later, Henry VIII will accept this opinion in his "Defense of the Seven Sacraments" against Luther, and the Anglican ordination formulary will incorporate (but modify) it.

Vestments

Necessity for the priest's arms to have greater freedom of movement causes reduction in the conical shape of the chasuble around the 13th century. From 11th century the classical alb is gradually re-shaped into the fuller surplice to be worn over fur (superpelliceum >> "surplice") for choir habit and for administration of sacraments apart from Mass. Stole is worn by deacons over left shoulder outside dalmatic until 13th century. In later middle ages use of the tunicle is extended to crucifers and thurifers, who are normally in subdeacon's orders. During 11th century the episcopal mitre develops from pointed conical shape to one with horns on two sides by c. 1100, reflecting influence of the portrayal of the horned Moses in art and liturgical drama, c. 1050 and deriving ultimately from Jerome's Vulgate mistranslation of Exodus 34:29 [reading "horned" for "shone with light"]; first Aaron and other Jewish high priests begin to be depicted in art with mitres by assimilation to Moses, then Christian bishops thus as the Christian successors of the Jewish high priests; horns are front-and-back by mid-12th century; earliest mitres are "squat," with "higher" ones arising later in the Renaissance. Earliest known liturgical color sequence dates from the 12th century; the writings of Innocent III indicate a five-color sequence not unlike that known today, although variations persisted. Custom of veiling crucifixes, etc., during Lent dates from 10th and 11th centuries.

Reservation

Reservation of Eucharist inside church in an aumbry is fairly common by the 13th century, with certain exceptions: hanging pyx over altar is common in England from mid-12th century until Reformation, hanging dove is more common in France, especially in 13th century, sacrament houses after 14th century in Germany and the Low Countries. Continuous light is burned before reserved sacrament frequently after 12th century. Feast of Corpus Christi originates in 13th century (first in 1246). Use of monstrance and Corpus Christi processions (first c. 1277) are common after mid-14th century. Evolution of monstrance from reliquary in late 13th century; according to legend St. Clare of Assisi defended her sisters and convent from Saracen attack in mid-13th century by simply holding up the monstrance before the enemy. Mass is celebrated in presence of Blessed Sacrament exposed as early as mid-14th century, but not common until later. Popes travel with reserved sacrament from 14th to 18th centuries. Benediction of Blessed Sacrament, although known in the 15th century, is not widespread until 16th century and later.

Liturgical Books

From 11th to 13th centuries, Missal, Breviary, Pontifical, and Ritual, all based upon principle of differentiation by sacrament or service, develop out of earlier Sacramentaries and other books that were based upon differentiation by function or person. One priest now reads entire Mass from the Missal; no lay people or other books needed. By c. 1100 it becomes common for its instructions to be written in red, hence called "rubrics." By 14th and 15th centuries the Lord's Words of Institution come to be set apart in Missals by special lettering, as they have come to be set apart ritually by elevations and genuflections. Adoption by Francis of Assisi in 1223 of the Missal of the Roman Curia for obligatory use in his order ensures that it will become the dominant usage of the high and later Middle Ages, and in 1570 it will thus become the basis for the post-Tridentine Missal. Daily office of B.V.M. is regularized and spreads in 11th century under influence of Peter Damian and the Gregorian Reform. Development of Breviary in early 13th century under Franciscan influence, whereby Roman usage is spread. Also by 13th century, Books of Hours for lay devotion are compiled by combining portions of the Psalter, Little Office of the B.V.M., Offices of the Cross and of the Holy Ghost, Calendar, Litany of the Saints, Office of the Dead, and various other prayers.

5. Sixteenth Century: Protestant Reformation and Catholic Reform

From our perspective today, how were both these movements mistaken?

Thrust of the Reforms

Simplification of rites, demand for uniformity and for obedience to centralized directions. Church services, architecture, decorations,

vestments, vessels, books, terminology, theology, hymnody, etc., all develop in ways that tend to accentuate the differences between denominations. Protestant worship emphasizes simplicity and intelligibility, corporate aspects, conformity to Scripture especially on question of justification, Word of God in vernacular. Scripture is read in longer passages with extensive homiletical expositions (hence ministerial use of academic gowns, to symbolize instructive role of the minister). Anglican use of surplice, from medieval choir office, and academic doctoral robes as standard attire for Anglican bishops, also indicate educational purpose of worship. Andreas Karlstadt becomes the first priest to celebrate Mass in the vernacular (German) in 1526. All major reformers except Zwingli desire the Lord's Supper with communion to be the normal Sunday worship, but this fails because the late medieval tradition of non-communicating attendance clashes with the reformers' desires for Eucharistic celebration only when all will communicate. (Even Zwingli's call for the Lord's Supper four times a year was four times more often than later medieval church people were accustomed to communicate.) Luther's book on the Babylonian Captivity of the Church (1520) attacks the medieval sacramental system of Peter Lombard, Aquinas, and the Council of Florence, reducing the number of sacraments to two, which will be anathematized by Trent, after which Protestants will be locked into asserting two only and Catholics into seven, each claiming the institution of Christ as the reason! Prayers in the liturgies of the Reformers change from the first person singular of the medieval priest to the first person plural of the congregation, intended as denial of priestly mediation. Desire for immediate, direct, personal experience of the Spirit tends to obviate traditional written prayers and sermons. Reformers continue to reflect medieval pre-occupations, however, in worship that is still focussed upon clergy and choir, and they know little or nothing of patristic liturgies not yet discovered (e.g., Didache in 1873, Hippolytus in 20th century). The clericalism of the Middle Ages, of the priest who alone could say Mass and dispense grace, is replaced by a new clericalism--of the preacher who alone can proclaim and interpret the Word of God (Price & Weil).

Eucharistic Controversies

Protestant Eucharistic controversy with Rome continues to center on the late medieval theme of the real presence.

Zwingli: denies real presence; Eucharist is a bare memorial, or commemoration only, of Christ's death, a picture, effected by God, that calls forth gratitude in the believer. Insofar as there is any "presence" at all for Zwingli it is a spiritual one, not in any way attached to the bread and wine, hence dubbed by Gregory Dix (perhaps unfairly) as the doctrine of the "real absence" (cf. Z's Attack on the Canon of the Mass, 1523). Zwingli and Luther dispute at the Marburg Colloquy, 1529, Zwingli denying any notion that the physical could convey the spiritual and holding that the sacraments are signs of grace already given, not (as for Luther) means of giving grace in response to faith.

Luther: believes in real presence "in, with, and under" the bread and wine ("Like fire in a red-hot iron"), but emphasizes faith; believes in an objective consecration effected by the words of institution only

(accompanied by elevations and preceded by Sanctus with Benedictus); denies transubstantiation as being a kind of work-righteousness, but agrees that others may believe in transubstantiation if not requiring it as dogma.

Calvin: Eucharistic virtualism, whereby the believer receives the virtue or power of the Body and Blood of Christ together with the elements of bread and wine, which are not themselves changed; by such a theology both Calvin and Bucer attempt to preserve the positive values of transubstantiation and real presence without the accompanying metaphysical explanations. For Calvin, the real presence, although not localized, is communicated through the virtue or power of the Holy Spirit, thus incorporating the participant but not implying any change in the bread and wine. Calvin thus takes a middle course between Zwingli and Luther and shifts the narrative of institution to be a lesson before the prayer begins. Consensus Tigurinus, 1549, brought Calvinist and Zwinglian positions close together and has been the main doctrinal position of the Reformed Church since then.

On the question of sacrifice: the reformers' insistence upon the unrepeatable uniqueness of Christ's sacrifice in the order of history soon resulted in a denial of its symbolic representation in the Mass, which then hardened into the "protestant" position that the Mass "is not" a sacrifice and the "catholic" position that it "is" a sacrifice. Eventually, the desacralizing tendencies of the 18th century Enlightenment will find repugnant the very notion that God would intervene in present time or use physical objects and actions to accomplish the divine will, and thus increasingly the overall thrust and result of Protestantism was to make of the sacraments merely pious exercises of memory, useful for inspiration and edification but no longer occasions of God's grace-filled action in the present.

## Penance

Both Luther and Calvin encourage non-obligatory private auricular confession as part of the process of sanctification--i.e., as following upon justification but not as a good work in itself. In England, reference to the patristic discipline of public penance in Lent, and desire that it may be restored, is made in the Commination Service in the 1549 and all subsequent major English Prayer Books. Cranmer retains provision for private confession and a formula for absolution in the Visitation of the Sick in the 1549 BCP (still in 1662). Article 25 of 1563 describes Penance as "commonly called" a sacrament, but denies that it is a "Sacrament of the Gospel." Canon 113 of 1604 warns clergy against revealing sins made known to them under the seal of confession, and this canon is one of the few from 1604 not superseded in 1969.

## In England

Cranmer and his associates have a vision of the English nation at prayer and produce a book for that purpose: for its subsequent development see works by Cuming, Echlin, Bradshaw, etc. Cranmer's view of the Eucharist, it has been suggested (Dix, Ratcliff, Couratin, Cuming, Grisbrooke, etc.), was not very different from that of Zwingli,

but with greater emphasis upon frequent communion and upon the operation of God's grace; Peter Brooks, however, holds that Cranmer's view was substantially Calvinist (cf. Dugmore). The poem attributed to Queen Elizabeth I best epitomizes overall the Anglican reformed Eucharistic theology:

> Christ was the Word that spake it.
> He took the bread and brake it.
> And what that Word did make it,
> I do believe and take it.

The first Scottish Book of Common Prayer appears in 1637 (with 1549 epiclesis restored), and reinforced by the Nonjurors of the 18th century it leads through the 1764 Scottish revision to the first American BCP of 1789. The English canon 1552-1662, however, omitted to say anything about the Resurrection, Ascension, or outpouring of the Holy Spirit; in its exclusive emphasis upon the Lord's suffering and death, it continued the late Middle Ages. Easter eve ceremonies, Easter sepulchre, continuous sacramental reservation, and hanging pyxes are all abolished in England in 1549. Crosses and crucifixes are abolished from Anglican altars at the time of the reformation and not restored until mid-19th century. One of the protests made by the catholic-minded conservative English opposition to the first (1549) BCP at the time of the English Reformation is that they should be required to receive communion no more frequently than once a year at Easter! Prayer of Humble Access, an example of the continuity of medieval subjective devotion, enters BCP at this time.

Roman Catholic Developments

Development of 40 Hours Devotion originates at Milan in 1527, projected as reparation to the Blessed Sacrament against the Reformers' denials of the real presence. Transubstantation is affirmed by the Council of Trent on the basis of Scotus, Ockham, and late medieval interpretations of the IV Lateran Council as excluding other points of view, but does not define it so narrowly as to imply that the material elements of bread and wine are abolished (which was the 15th century nominalist view!). Trent says that there is "by consecration" a "conversion" (Aquinas' preferred term) of the total substance of the bread into the substance of the Body and of the total substance of the wine into the substance of the Blood, "which conversion is suitably (most aptly) called transubstantiation," without explaining precisely how the conversion occurs (session 13, ch. 4, with canon 2). The Council of Trent says nothing, however, about the other "real" presences of Christ with which the reformers were concerned, and it would not be until Vatican II that the presence in the word of Scripture, in individual persons, and in communities at worship was affirmed. Trent also suppresses the plurality of medieval liturgical usages (a suppression which many late medieval catholic reformers had in fact called for); anathematizes any who say that the Mass ought to be celebrated only in the vulgar tongue (session 22, ch. 8, with canon 9) explaining in August of 1562 that "There would be great danger of various errors arising in many translations, with the result that the mysteries of our faith, which are in fact one, would seem rather to

differ;" urges frequent devotional confession but stresses that both justification and sanctification come primarily by Baptism and only secondarily by Penance; makes required the vesting prayers before Mass that have been optional but customary since the 9th century. Reservation of the Sacrament in a tabernacle on the high altar in R.C. churches becomes increasingly common after the mid-16th century (and is prescribed in the new Roman ritual of 1614) except during pontifical Masses and in churches where choir office is recited before the high altar. Thrones of exposition and Mass "coram sanctissimo" now develop, modeled after 17th century court protocol; the baroque church interior now being constructed like an audience chamber of the monarch and the baroque Mass becoming a "church concert with liturgical accompaniment," the liturgy being "submerged under a beautiful sea of sound." Vernacular translations of the Missal, even for private reading by the faithful, are prohibited by the pope in 1661 (prohibition renewed in 1857), and vernacular translation of the canon is forbidden until 1897. Communion is frequently given outside of Mass. The amice is no longer worn over the priest's head once men's hair-style is shortened after the Renaissance. Pectoral cross as symbol of episcopal rank is not required by Rome until 17th century, although it was frequently worn even in much earlier periods and at times even by priests (as in the East). Altar cross in the form of a crucifix is not required by Rome until 1746, and six candlesticks on the altar are not required by Rome until the 17th century.

R.C. Period of "Rubricism and Immobility"

On 4 December 1563 the Fathers of the Council of Trent in their final (25th) session vote that all authority in liturgical "reform" rests with the pope. And after only minor changes the medieval Roman breviary and missal are soon promulgated afresh by Pope (St.) Pius V (1566-72) as the Pian breviary (1568) and Missal (1570), now (1570) made obligatory upon all western churches and monasteries that could not claim some other continuous local liturgical usage at least two centuries old. (Some French dioceses under "Gallican" influence, and having their own liturgical traditions more than 200 years old, did opt for independence from such Romano-centralization.) The decree Quo Primum of Pope Pius V (19 July 1570), regularly published as the first authoritative document in pre-Vatican II Roman Missals, established this "Tridentine" Missal and Mass with considerable finality: "We command and strictly order all persons in authority of whatever dignity or rank, cardinals not excluded, in virtue of holy obedience, to celebrate the Mass according to the rite, manner, and norm now given from us by this missal, henceforth entirely putting aside all other rites and ceremonies customarily observed from other older missals; nor may they presume to add or recite any other ceremonies or prayers in the celebration of Mass than those contained in this missal. And by the tenor of these presents we grant and declare in perpetuity by apostolic authority that hereafter they shall altogether follow this missal in every Mass in every sort of church without any scruple of conscience or incurral of any penalties, sentences, or censures, and that they can and may thus use it freely and legally. Similarly we decide and decree that no one at all in any

priest's orders whatsoever can be held to celebrate Mass in any other way than has been decided by us, nor be compelled or forced by anyone to change this missal; nor can these present letters at any time ever be revoked but rather shall exist forever firm and valid in their strength....And if, nevertheless, anyone should ever dare attempt any action contrary to this order of ours, let him know that he has incurred the wrath of Almighty God and of the blessed apostles Peter and Paul." After the Missal of 1570, moreover, there followed the Roman Pontifical of 1596 and the Roman Ritual of 1614. All this inaugurated what has been called by Klauser the "period of rubricism and immobility" in R.C. liturgical matters, after which all R.C. liturgical "initiative" came to be held by the Apostolic See, which for that purpose established the Sacred Congregation of Rites in 1588, and anything not prescribed by rubrics was forbidden.

6. Twentieth Century: ? ? ?

In the wake of the Second Vatican Council, the "period of rubricism and immobility" in the Roman Catholic church inaugurated in 1563 finally came to an end with the promulgation of the Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy by Vatican Council II on 4 December 1963, exactly four centuries following the Tridentine vote. And in the apostolic constitution Missale Romanum of 3 April 1969 Pope Paul VI made new prescriptions that swept away the Quo Primum with these astonishing words: "We decree that these laws and prescriptions be firm and effective now and in the future, notwithstanding, to the extent necessary, the apostolic constitutions and ordinances issued by our predecessors and other prescriptions, even those deserving special mention and derogation." Such a complete reversal of 1563 was the constitution of 1969 that R.C. "traditionalists" today have understandably questioned the authority by which Paul VI presumed to set aside the Quo Primum, and even so moderate a conservative as Louis Bouyer has had this to say about the alterations that abolished the old Roman canon: "The Roman Canon, as it is today, goes back to Gregory the Great. There is not, in the East or West, a Eucharistic prayer remaining in use to this day that can boast such antiquity. In the eyes not only of the Orthodox but of Anglicans and even those Protestants who have still to some extent a feeling for tradition, to jettison it would amount to a rejection of any claim on the part of the Roman Church to represent the true Catholic Church." (Quoted in Michael Davies, Cranmer's Godly Order, vol. I, p. 80). And liturgical reform in many other churches of the west during the second half of the 20th century has followed a similar course.

Question: Is the best contemporary liturgy today achieved by placing the earliest worship in a very modern context, or is it rather achieved by a selective synthesis of all periods of worship, in much the same way that even the best of the modern world is a selective synthesis of the best that has gone before us?

In the 20th century we who live today not only study history, we also create it (Dom Jean LeClercq). "We must be we must be the authors of the history of our age; more than an audience, more even than actors" (Madeleine K. Albright in 1997).